In its rich selection of topics, this volume calls to mind the pleasant variety that awaits musicologists at the International Congress on Medieval Studies at Western Michigan University, the vast interdisciplinary conference that brings together medievalists of all stripes each year early in May. For many decades at the Congress, the music and dance historian Ingrid Brainard organized a series of ‘Musicology at Kalamazoo’ sessions that still continues today. To honor their departed friend and colleague, the editors of this volume have collected contributions that reflect the delightful eclecticism of those sessions, and in some cases were originally presented in that setting. Thus, although reviewers often find fault with the lack of homogeneity in books intended to honor a colleague rather than to explore a theme, in this case it is precisely the multiplicity of subjects and approaches that yields a fitting tribute to the lively, wide-ranging intellect of the dedicatee.

The essays address chant, polyphony, and performance practice from the early Middle Ages to the seventeenth century, from song to dance, manuscript to print, and from northern to southern Europe. As the titles of the book’s main divisions make clear, the central organizing principle is that of repertory created, interpreted, and reevaluated.

The volume’s first part, ‘The Creation of the Repertory’, addresses the genesis of particular musical compositions or repertories. The first contribution in this part of the volume is ‘The Codex Calixtinus and the French Connection: The Office for St James in Northern France’, in which Vincent Corrigan demonstrates cogently that the first Gregorian proper office for St James, found in late sources from the church of St Jacques de la Boucherie in Paris, is actually an adaptation of the earlier
office for St Nicholas; Corrigan supplies the inventory of the full office (preserved incompletely in two fifteenth-century manuscripts) using a sixteenth-century print. A later, rhymed office with newly composed melodies appears to have originated in Arras and is more unstable in its transmission. Situated between the types of office compilation and composition represented by these two offices is the service found in the Codex Calixtinus, ‘in which scriptural, or at least authoritative, texts are set to original or borrowed music’ (15). By exposing the chronological layers in the composition of offices for St James, Corrigan also points out the coexistence of the office types in the late Middle Ages in northern France.

In ‘The Roman Processional Antiphon Repertor’, Clyde Brockett compares the Old Roman and Gregorian antiphons sung during the procession from the gathering location (collecta) to the first station on several important feast days in the liturgical calendar. The transmission of processional antiphons and the interrelationships between cognate melodies suggests the conclusion that ‘processional antiphons might be considered some of the best indicators of Roman melody converted from Gregorian style’ (34). Since Brockett’s study discusses some of the chants for the procession on the feast of the Purification, which is the subject of the subsequent essay, it would have been helpful to link the two articles more explicitly.

Joseph Dyer’s magisterial ‘The Celebration of Candlemas in Medieval Rome’ reviews the origins of the feast in Jerusalem and Constantinople, its introduction at Rome soon after the middle of the seventh century with the wave of Greek-speaking immigrants, the establishment of a procession by the end of the seventh century, and emergence of the feast’s Marian character. In discussing the early chants associated with the procession, Dyer traces the background and
translation from Greek of the two antiphons ‘Ave gratia plena’ and ‘Adorna thalamum’.

In ‘Laureata plebs fidelis’: A Victorine Sequence from the Feast of Corpus Christi in Thirteenth-Century Liège’, Barbara Walters extends the argument, already published in her contribution to the collective edition *The Feast of Corpus Christi* (2006), that Juliana of Montcornillon composed the earliest Corpus Christi office. Here, Walters presents a detailed analysis of the sequence for Mass on the feast, proposing that it reflects Juliana’s ideas as well as reflecting her knowledge of thirteenth-century liturgy and theology.

Julia Wingo Shinnick’s ‘A Newly Recognized Polyphonic Christmas Gospel, Liber generationis And Another Look at the Polyphony in the Manuscript Assisi, Biblioteca del Sacro Convento, MS 695’, presents and analyzes an eighth polyphonic composition in a troper-proser written around 1230 for use in Reims (previously only seven were recognized) and resituates the other polyphonic compositions in light of this new discovery, connecting them to the image of the Coronation of the Virgin on the west façade of Reims Cathedral. Shinnick proposes that the polyphonic Mass Ordinary pieces and four polyphonic Marian sequences performed on feasts of the Virgin Mary, and that the polyphonic Gospel would be sung on the feasts of the Nativity and Conception of the Virgin. She suggests, furthermore, that the Gospel could be sung on Christmas along with the three polyphonic Ordinary settings, which might also have been added for the dedication of the choir on the eve of the Nativity of the Virgin.

In ‘Prope est ruina: The Transformation of a Medieval Tenor’, Alice V. Clark compares Machaut’s reuse of a tenor from a motet originally found in the notated manuscript of the interpolated *Roman de Fauvel* to the strategy of ‘misreading’ first described by Harold Bloom in *The Anxiety of Influence*. According to Bloom, small but significant clues
signaled an author’s desire to conceal the influence of another text. By analogy, Clark argues that a single variant in the tenor (absent other, more obvious connections between the two motets) points to Machaut’s purposeful reworking of his source. Clark’s deft reading of the literary context shows the underlying link between political allegory and lover’s complaint: whereas the earlier motet decries Fauvel’s influence on clerics, Machaut’s motet portrays the lover ruined by his condition, subtly achieving a rich layering of meaning by virtue of its relationship to the source.

Richard Agee, ‘Ideological Clashes in a Cinquecento Edition of Plainchant’, untangles the history of the first few post-Tridentine chant editions, focusing on those printed by Angelo Gardano in Venice. Modal analysis of the chants in the Gardano Graduale, et antiphonarium of 1587, in comparison to three other post-Tridentine editions (two of them reformed, one of them traditional), reveals the influence of theory and practice on the melodies, which varies from book to book. As Agee demonstrates there is evidence that the reform of chant melodies continued in the late 1580s in Venice, incorporating earlier (or perhaps even ongoing) contributions of Palestrina and Zoilo.

The second section of the volume, ‘Interpreting the Repertory’, addresses the communication of ideas about music and dance in the fourteenth and fifteenth centuries. These chapters move smoothly from exemplary readings of extra-musical sources to an analysis of manuscript transmission and musical emulation, and close with two reflections on the cultural meanings generated by dance.

Cathy Ann Elias’s engaging essay ‘Music on the Run in Italian Novelle: Plagues, Devotional Movements, and Intimate Gatherings Away from Home’ uses the descriptions of ideal musical performances in narrative fiction (usually in the frame, or cornice, of the travel narratives known as novelle) as a window onto the performance practice of music.
for entertainment in late-medieval and Renaissance Italy. Although others have commented on the role of musical performance in famous examples such as the cornice of the Decameron, Elias gleans the evidence of several different texts dating from the fourteenth to the sixteenth century, yielding salient observations on the various manners of singing madrigals from memory, and the important role of instruments in the performance of vocal music.

Eleonora M. Beck’s essay ‘Dancing in the Street: Fourteenth-Century Representations of Music and Justice’, takes as a point of departure the dancing figures in Ambrogio Lorenzetti’s fresco depicting good government in Siena’s Palazzo Pubblico. In Beck’s reading, this famous image signals the link between music and the ideal of justice in the late Middle Ages; the Summa Theologica of Aquinas as well as the Decameron and the Roman de Fauvel provide textual support for the connection. Beck further points out parallels between the Lorenzetti frescoes and Giotto’s frescoes in the Scrovegni Chapel at Padua: both situate dancers with a tambourine in the depiction of good government or justice, and likewise, both portray dancers as victims of violence in the pendant scenes of bad government or injustice. A slightly different interpretation of the Lorenzetti fresco appears in an article of nearly the same title (not cited by Beck) by Jonathan Alexander, who mentions that dancing in the street was prohibited in Siena by civic statute. According to Alexander, the dancing in Lorenzetti’s fresco embodies the harmony that will ultimately result from the union depicted in the marriage procession juxtaposed with the round dance.¹

Elizabeth Randell Upton, ‘Apres vos fais: Machaut Reception as Seen through the Chantilly Codex (F-CH 564)’, points out that this famous early fifteenth-century manuscript (unusual for its large number

of attributions to composers) is the only anthology containing Machaut’s works to attribute them correctly. Not only the collection’s three Machaut ballades, but also three other compositions that relate to Machaut (laments for the composer and new ballades loosely based on his works), signal ongoing interest in his music long decades his death. Randell Upton sees two distinct groups as generating this varied reception of Machaut’s music in the Chantilly Codex: those who knew many of the composer’s works, and those who knew fewer of them but regarded Machaut as an object for quotation and imitation. The article thus furnishes a useful perspective not only on Machaut’s reputation, but on the role of a music book as a mediator between old and new, and as a window onto musical reception and compositional practice.

In ‘Reading (into?) Renaissance Dance: Misura in the Service of Dramaturgy’, Nona Monahin examines the treatment of misure (or meters) in fifteenth-century dance treatises as a source for the cultural meaning of the ballo. Just as the misure served to relate dance forms proportionally by tempo, they also distinguished correspondingly different dancing styles whose connotations heightened underlying gender dynamics and reinforced behavioral norms through social dancing (including the association of different dancing styles with men and women). Within this framework, Monahin investigates the cultural meanings generated by role reversal in the pizzochara, a dance with an intriguing name that suggests a reference to women whose exceptionally independent way of life subjected them to social satire.

Jennifer Nevile, in ‘Dance and Identity in Fifteenth-Century Europe’, takes up the association of dance with national identity through the parameters of choreographic structure and style, the dancers’ gestures and costumes, and (perhaps most difficult to view in ‘national’ terms because of its stylization) dance music. Cross-reference with Yvonne Kendall’s essay, described below, might have been helpful here.
Nevile makes the important point that the choreographic performance of identify, and therefore the construction of identity, was based in large part on distinguishing the self from the other; calculating the effect on foreign visitors was part of the planning of spectacles involving dance. The final section of the collection, ‘Reevaluating the Repertory’, presents case studies that present information crucial to understanding the early performance conditions of repertories or seek to reconstruct the original substance of particular works.

William Mahrt provides a brief but useful overview of the physical setting for the performance of sacred vocal repertories in ‘Acoustics, Liturgy, and Architecture in Medieval English Cathedrals’. This article is based in part on the author’s experience leading groups of singers in the performance of medieval chant and polyphony in southern English cathedrals. Mahrt notes that English lady chapels are ideal spaces for late-medieval compositions for three voices sung one to a part, whereas the choir is better suited to the choral performance of chant. He has found that choir screens in the choir and low ceilings in the cloister concentrate sound, while the experience of processing from the cloister into the nave is heightened by the shift of acoustical environment. The chapter house proves to be the space least appropriate for singing. Thus each space is acoustically distinct and well designed for the repertory associated with it.

Moving from architecture to notation, in “Haec est nimis’: A Trope-Transcription Puzzle’, Greta-Mary Hair takes up the challenge of determining the pitch content for an Aquitanian Introit trope melody notated in campo aperto. As is often the case for music preserved only in staffless neumes, here the transcriber must reconcile variant versions with the sometimes divergent parameters of melodic contour, modal theory, musical genre, and notational convention or scribal idiosyncrasies. By dint of patient reconstruction, Hair arrives at a
transcription that, in her estimation, most closely reflects the intentions of the scribe of the manuscript Paris, BnF lat. 903.

In ‘Compositional Method and Inspirational Guesswork: Reconstructing the Latin Motets of Martin Peerson (ca. 1572-1651)’, Richard Rastall shows the valuable insights that can be gained from undertaking a stylistically informed reconstruction of a missing voice. Rastall’s clear account of his process, generously illustrated by musical examples, provides a model for further work in this vein. Several salient observations in Rastall’s chapter point out that studying the works of a composer like Peerson familiarizes the music historian with a style probably more typical of the period in which he lived than the works that are better known today. A comparable endeavor on a larger scale is the ongoing ‘Lost Voices’ project (based in Tours and at Haverford College), which involves reconstructing a lost voice from chansons published in 1569 by the Parisian printer Nicolas du Chemin.

Barbara Sparti’s ‘Dance and Historiography: Le Balet Comique de la Royne, an Italian Perspective’ is an instructive reassessment of the historiography of a well-known spectacle. Through her lucid exposition of the sources and broader context for Le Balet Comique, the author demonstrates the ways in which its sparsely documented choreography has been misinterpreted by modern dance historians. For the non-specialist, this contribution is a very welcome initiation into several aspects of early modern dance studies. One hopes that dance historians will heed its call for revision, in particular the need to take evidence on earlier Italian spectacles into account when evaluating the historical significance of Le Balet Comique.

G. Yvonne Kendall’s ‘Mutanze, Divisions, and Diferencias: Variation Form in Late Renaissance Dance’ invites the reader into the atelier of the musicologist specialized in dance history. This study presents the results of Kendall’s comprehensive musico-choreographic analysis of variations
in printed and manuscript sources (including scores, choreographies, and dance treatises) from the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries, clearly demonstrating that patterns in choreography are fundamental to the understanding of early variations in music. Kendall points out that ‘the same dances were viewed as most appropriate for variation treatment in both dance and music sources’ (337); this general insight is as useful to music historians as Kendall’s specific observations on variation forms and dance genres.

Ann Buckley and Cynthia Cyrus have succeeded in assembling the variegated tesselae of many authors into a colorful mosaic that rewards careful reading. While far from homogenous, this book’s contents are interrelated in methodology, for whether they focus on music, dance, literature, or architecture, they all draw new insight from the contemplation of primary sources.

Susan Boynton
Department of Music
Columbia University
slb184@columbia.edu